

# no-fault newsline

A ROAD MAP FOR MOTOR VEHICLE INSURERS AND OWNERS

08.02.11

## UIM Coverage Held To Be Illusory When Equal To Michigan Minimum Bodily Injury Liability Limits

By Daniel Rizzo

On July 14, 2011, the Court of Appeals issued its published decision in *Ile v Foremost Insurance Company*, which held that optional \$20,000/\$40,000 Underinsured Motorist Coverage purchased by Plaintiff's decedent was illusory. Under the policy language, benefits would never be afforded.

Plaintiff's decedent recovered the full \$20,000 limit of liability insurance coverage from a tortfeasor after being killed while riding a motorcycle. Prior to his death, the decedent had purchased optional Underinsured Motorist Benefits (UIM) from Defendant Foremost which were bundled with Uninsured Motorist (UM) benefits and sold under a single rate. Thereafter, Plaintiff sought the

#### **SECREST WARDLE NOTES:**

Claimants will now be allowed to proceed with recovery of UIM benefits when the policy limits are equal to the state minimum bodily injury liability limit of \$20,000, despite policy language that provides for a set-off or a reduction based on the amount recovered from the tortfeasor.

\$20,000 in UIM benefits from Foremost. The claim was denied as the Foremost policy contained unambiguous language that prevented a duplicate recovery as Plaintiff had already recovered an identical sum from the tortfeasor.

The Court of Appeals upheld the trial court's finding that based on the language contained in the Foremost policy of insurance, the UIM coverage purchased by the decedent was illusory as recovery of benefits was impossible. Simply put, there would never be a factual scenario where the insured could collect UIM benefits under the policy. The insured paid for UIM benefits, but could never receive them.

The Court went on to identify two theories of UIM coverage: one will assure that the policy holder will receive at least the amount of UIM benefits purchased; the other will afford additional coverage in excess of that held by the tortfeasor. The Court selected the latter theory to be controlling in this case. Thus, Plaintiff will be allowed to proceed with recovery up to the \$20,000 UIM policy limits.

### CONTACT US

#### **Farmington Hills**

30903 Northwestern Highway, P.O. Box 3040 Farmington Hills, MI 48333-3040 Tel: 248-851-9500 Fax: 248-851-2158

#### Mt. Clemens

94 Macomb Place, Mt. Clemens, MI 48043-5651 Tel: 586-465-7180 Fax: 586-465-0673

6639 Centurion Drive, Ste. 130, Lansing, MI 48917 Tel: 517-886-1224 Fax: 517-886-9284

#### **Grand Rapids**

2025 East Beltline SE, Ste. 209, Grand Rapids, MI 49546 Tel: 616-285-0143 Fax: 616-285-0145

www.secrestwardle.com



Copyright 2011 Secrest, Wardle, Lynch, Hampton, Truex and Morley, P.C.

This newsletter is published for the purpose of providing information and does not constitute legal advice and should not be considered as such. This newsletter or any portion of this newsletter is not to be distributed or copied without the express written consent of Secrest Wardle.

### CONTRIBUTORS

#### Motor Vehicle Litigation Practice Group Chairs

Thomas J. Azoni John H. Cowley, Jr.

#### Editor

Bonny Craft

We welcome your questions and comments.

#### OTHER MATERIALS

If you would like to be on the distribution list for No-Fault Newsline, or for newsletters pertaining to any of our other practice groups, please contact Secrest Wardle Marketing at swsubscriptions@secrestwardle.com or 248-539-2850.

#### Other newsletters include:

Benchmarks - Navigating the hazards of legal malpractice

Blueprints – Mapping legal solutions for the construction industry

Boundaries – A guide for property owners and insurers in a litigious society

Community Watch – Breaking developments in governmental litigation

Contingencies - A guide for dealing with catastrophic property loss

Fair Use – Protecting ideas in a competitive world In the Margin – Charting legal trends affecting businesses

Industry Line - Managing the hazards of environmental toxic tort litigation

Landowner's Alert – Defense strategies for property owners and managers
On the Beat – Responding to litigation affecting law enforcement

On the Job - Tracking developments in employment law

Safeguards - Helping insurers protect their clients

Standards - A guide to avoiding risks for professionals

State of the Art – Exploring the changing face of product liability

Structures - A framework for defending architects and engineers

Vital Signs - Diagnosing the changing state of medical malpractice and nursing home liability